**Dieting and Exercise Are Largely Ineffective**

*Obesity*, 2010 *(Retrieved April 8, 2014 from Opposing Viewpoints in Context)*

Dieting and Exercise Are Largely Ineffective

"Permanent, substantial weight loss appears to be almost impossible by diet and exercise alone."

In the following viewpoint, Judy Foreman argues that attempts to lose weight by means of diet and exercise are futile for most overweight and obese people. Once people become overweight or obese, she writes, hormones that control appetite make sure the body hangs on to the excess fat. For this reason, when overweight people lose weight, they usually gain it back. Foreman suggests that people who are overweight or obese should try to eat healthily and exercise in order to remain as fit as possible despite their extra pounds. Foreman is a health columnist for the *Boston Globe*.

As you read, consider the following questions:

1. What percentage of obese people can lose weight through diet and exercise, according to Dr. Lee Kaplan, as cited by the author?
2. What is the body's "set point," as defined by Foreman?
3. Why does the author believe that genes are not to blame for today's obesity problem?

Is permanent, significant weight loss really possible?

If you're talking merely 10 to 20 pounds—and nobody knows the actual figure—you probably can diet and exercise your way to a svelter self and stay there, provided you stick with your weight control program rigorously. Forever.

But if you're among the two-thirds of adult Americans who are overweight or obese, permanent, substantial weight loss appears to be almost impossible by diet and exercise alone.

Only about 1 to 2 percent of obese people can permanently lose weight through diet and exercise alone, said Dr. Lee Kaplan director of the weight center at Massachusetts General Hospital.

"Dieting is like holding your breath," he said. "You can do it, but not for long. Your body is stronger than your willpower."

In other words, Americans have probably wasted way too much time, money, and hope on diet programs that don't help enough. It still makes sense, however, to eat as healthily as you can and to do whatever you can to avoid gaining any more weight.

**The Ineffectiveness of Dieting**

One famous study conducted at the University of Minnesota during World War II illustrates the ineffectiveness of severe dieting. The researchers put 36 physically and emotionally healthy young men of normal weight on a strict diet, allowing them only half the calories they were used to. The men lost weight, but became psychological wrecks, obsessing about food, bingeing, and, even after the diet was over, eating way too much, often 8,000 to 10,000 calories a day until they regained the weight, recounted *New York Times* science writer Gina Kolata in her recent book, *Re-thinking Thin.*

In another classic study in the 1950s, researchers at Rockefeller University in New York City recruited obese people who were so desperate to lose weight that they agreed to live in the hospital for eight months, including a four-month period in which they subsisted on only 600 calories a day of liquid formula. They lost weight, Kolata noted. But, to the dismay of subjects and researchers, they all quickly regained the weight.

**The Role of Hormones**

That's because the basic biochemistry of the body's weight management system can work against even highly motivated dieters.

When a very fat person loses a lot of weight by diet and exercise, the brain goes into panic mode, reading a complex array of chemical signals as proof of impending starvation. Metabolism slows. The body hangs on to every calorie it can get. The chemical signals that trigger appetite soar, creating a drive to eat so powerful you can't resist. From the standpoint of evolution, this makes sense: Our DNA was built when we were hunter-gatherers to protect us against starvation, not obesity.

Consider one of the best-studied weight control hormones, leptin, which is made in fat cells and is designed to tell the brain: "Stop eating. I'm full."

"Obese people usually have high levels of leptin because they have so many fat cells making it," said Dr. Eleftheria Maratos-Flier, an obesity researcher and associate professor of medicine at [Boston's] Beth Israel Deaconess Medical Center. "The heavier you are, the higher the circulating leptin." In theory, being fat should mean that the brain would be flooded with "stop eating" signals.

But when people go on severe diets, "they lose more leptin than you would expect. So the brain thinks there is less fat than there ought to be," which makes people eat more, she said.

And leptin is just one of many hormones involved in weight control. "In the stomach and intestines alone," Kaplan said, "there are 36 hormones that regulate weight, and another 30 in the brain. The end result of all these chemicals is to keep our energy stores, that is, fat, in balance."

**The Body's "Set Point"**

Put differently, some researchers believe that one reason weight loss programs ultimately fail is that diet and exercise do not change the body's "set point," the thermostat-like mechanism in the hypothalamus and other parts of the brain that keep weight fairly constant.

Dr. David Heber, director of the University of California, Los Angeles (UCLA) Center for Human Nutrition, is more optimistic about the effectiveness of dieting. "The set point can be changed. Yes, there are signals to eat and to hoard fat, but having said that, humans do adapt to starvation and do change," he said. While the hormones that control appetite and satiety do tilt the equation toward regaining lost weight, "psychology trumps physiology. I see people every day who have overcome their genes and kept their excess weight off for decades."

Many researchers do agree that one weight loss strategy does seem to change the set point—bariatric surgery, the stomach-stapling procedure. Doctors used to think it worked by simply reducing the size of the stomach, preventing people from eating much. Now, they think it works because, with less stomach tissue pumping out hormones such as ghrelin, which stimulates appetite, a person's appetite and satiety signals may be altered to help them eat less.

**A Liberating Message?**

So if dieting sets up a battle between our free will and our hormones, are America's fat masses wasting their time desperately trying to lose weight?

To some, including the National Association to Advance Fat Acceptance, a civil rights organization that is fighting discrimination against fat people, all this suggests not so much a hopeless message as a liberating one. "Most people do not choose to be fat," said the group spokeswoman, Peggy Howell. "But once people are fat, it is next to impossible to change that. It's far healthier to accept who you are and get on with your life than to be obsessed with what goes into your mouth."

That makes a lot of sense to me, though I resist the idea that our genes are the big culprits because we have basically the same genes today that our skinnier grandparents had. What's changed is our lifestyles—more sitting around eating Twinkies, less walking to and from daily activities.

So, here's my take. Because of the body's complex biochemistry, it's very difficult to lose weight once you gain it. So, exercise as much as you can—for general health, in addition to weight control. Eat right—fewer refined carbs, more fruits and veggies—again, for general health. If you're fat, don't just blame your genes and let yourself get fatter and fatter.

At the same time, be gentle with yourself, and with fat people you see.

**Further Readings**

**Books**

* America's Trust for Health *F as in Fat: How Obesity Policies Are Failing America*. Washington, DC: America's Trust for Health, 2009.
* Eric J. Bailey *Food Choice and Obesity in Black America: Creating a New Cultural Diet*. Westport, CT: Praeger, 2006.
* Kelly D. Brownell *Food Fight: The Inside Story of the Food Industry, America's Obesity Crisis, and What We Can Do About It*. New York: McGraw-Hill, 2004.
* Ian W. Campbell *Obesity: Your Questions Answered*. New York: Churchill Livingstone, 2005.
* Paul F. Campos *The Obesity Myth: Why America's Obsession with Weight Is Hazardous to Your Health*. New York: Gotham, 2004.
* Hank Cardello, with Doug Garr *Stuffed: An Insider's Look at Who's (Really) Making America Fat*. New York: Ecco, 2009.
* Greg Crister *Fat Land: How Americans Became the Fattest People in the World*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 2004.
* Garth Davis *The Expert's Guide to Weight-Loss Surgery: Is It Right for Me? What Happens During Surgery? How Do I Keep the Weight Off?* New York: Hudson Street, 2009.
* Nancy Deville *Death by Supermarket: The Fattening, Dumbing Down, and Poisoning of America*. Fort Lee, NJ: Barricade, 2007.
* Kathi A. Earles and Sandra E. Moore *Scale Back: Why Childhood Obesity Is Not Just About Weight*. Chicago: Hilton, 2008.
* Eric A. Finkelstein and Laurie Zuckerman *The Fattening of America: How the Economy Makes Us Fat, If It Matters, and What to Do About It*. Hoboken, NJ: Wiley, 2008.
* Sander L. Gilman *Fat: A Cultural History of Obesity*. Cambridge, UK: Polity, 2008.
* Rhonda L. Hamilton *A Guide to Weight Loss Surgery: Professional and Personal Views*. Westport, CT: Praeger, 2008.
* Richard J. Johnson *The Sugar Fix: The High-Fructose Fallout That Is Making You Fat and Sick*. Emmaus, PA: Rodale, 2008.
* David A. Kessler *The End of Overeating: Taking Control of the Insatiable American Appetite*. Emmaus, PA: Rodale, 2009.
* Elaine D. Kolish and C. Lee Peeler *Changing the Landscape of Food and Beverage Advertising: The Children's Food and Beverage Advertising Initiative in Action*. Arlington, VA: Council of Better Business Bureaus, 2008.
* Don Kulick *Fat: The Anthropology of an Obsession*. New York: Jeremy P. Tarcher/Penguin, 2005.
* James Levine *Move a Little, Lose a Lot: New NEAT Science Reveals How to Be Thinner, Happier, and Smarter*. New York: Crown, 2009.
* J. Michael McGinnis, Jennifer Appleton Gootman, and Vivica I. Kraak, eds. *Food Marketing to Children and Youth: Threat or Opportunity?* Washington, DC: National Academies, 2006.
* Susan Okie *Fed Up! Winning the War Against Childhood Obesity*. Washington, DC: Joseph Henry, 2005.
* Eric J. Oliver *Fat Politics: The Real Story Behind America's Obesity Epidemic*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2006.
* Lynn Parker, Annina Catherine Burns, and Eduardo Sanchez, eds. *Local Government Action to Prevent Childhood Obesity*. Washington, DC: National Academies, 2009.
* Barry Popkin *The World Is Fat: The Fads, Trends, Policies, and Products That Are Fattening the Human Race*. New York: Penguin, 2009.
* Michael L. Power *The Evolution of Obesity*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2009.
* Alexander G. Schauss *Obesity: Why Are Men Getting Pregnant?* Laguna Beach, CA: Basic Health, 2006.
* Patricia K. Smith *Obesity Among Poor Americans: Is Public Assistance the Problem?* Nashville: Vanderbilt University Press, 2009.
* Linda Smolak *Body Image, Eating Disorders, and Obesity in Youth: Assessment, Prevention, and Treatment*. 2nd ed. Washington, DC: American Psychological Association, 2009.
* Lisa Tartamella *Generation Extra Large: Rescuing Our Children from an Epidemic of Obesity*. New York: Basic Books, 2004.

**Periodicals**

* Kayce T. Ataiyero "Diet Aids May Slim Only Your Wallet," *Chicago Tribune*, December 30, 2008.
* Kelly D. Brownell et al. "The Public Health and Economic Benefits of Taxing Sugar-Sweetened Beverages," *New England Journal of Medicine*, October 15, 2009.
* John Cloud "Why Exercise Won't Make You Thin," *Time*, August 9, 2009.
* Harold Goldstein and Eric Schlosser "Putting Health on the Menu," *Los Angeles Times*, August 5, 2009.
* Derrick Z. Jackson "Soda Tax: It's the Real Thing," *Boston Globe*, September 19, 2009.
* Jeff Jacoby "Want a Warning Label with Those Fries?" *Boston Globe*, January 11, 2009.
* Jim Kling "An Overweight Man Learns He Can't Hide Behind His Mom's Genes," *Washington Post*, February 24, 2009.
* Katherine Mangu-Ward "Five Myths About Sin Taxes on Soda," *Washington Post*, September 27, 2009.
* Henry Miller "Foolish Food Fads," *Washington Times*, January 3, 2008.
* Shari Roan "Gastric Bypass Before Babies?" *Los Angeles Times*, September 7, 2009.
* Jacob Sullum "Are You *Sure* You Want Fries with That?" *Reason*, August 20, 2008.



**Full Text:** COPYRIGHT 2011 Greenhaven Press, a part of Gale, Cengage Learning.

**Source Citation**

Foreman, Judy. "Dieting and Exercise Are Largely Ineffective." *Obesity*. Scott Barbour. Detroit: Greenhaven Press, 2010. Opposing Viewpoints. Rpt. from "Let the Post-diet Era Begin." *Boston Globe* 1 Oct. 2007. *Opposing Viewpoints in Context*. Web. 8 Apr. 2014.

Document URL
http://ic.galegroup.com/ic/ovic/ViewpointsDetailsPage/ViewpointsDetailsWindow?failOverType=&query=&prodId=OVIC&windowstate=normal&contentModules=&mode=view&displayGroupName=Viewpoints&limiter=&currPage=&disableHighlighting=true&displayGroups=&sortBy=&search\_within\_results=&p=OVIC&action=e&catId=&activityType=&scanId=&documentId=GALE%7CEJ3010380252&source=Bookmark&u=ndul&jsid=5693a5f0b83b3b3ce94acf307d6bb525



**Gale Document Number:** GALE|EJ3010380252